# 10/08/2025 A.S. Board of Directors Meeting

## Minutes

Associated Students San Jose State University
10/8/2025 3:00 PMPDT
@ Student Union Meeting Room 1A, Zoom: https://sjsu.zoom.us/j/85916216835

I. Call to Order

Chair Agustin calls the meeting to order at 3:02 PM.

II. Land Acknowledgement

Chair Agustin reads the land acknowledgement.

Land Acknowledgement.pdf

III. Roll Call

The recording secretary completes roll call.
*Quorum met.*

IV. Approval of the Agenda

**Motion:**
Chair Agustin recommends a motion to approve the agenda.

Motion moved by Director Subramanyan and motion seconded by Director De Oliveira.
Vote: 9-0-0, Motion Passed.

**Motion:**
Director Subramanyan made a motion to table Item 8 indefinitely.

Motion moved by Director Subramanyan and motion seconded by Director De Oliveira.
Vote: 9-0-0, Motion Passed.

**Motion:**
Vote: 9-0-0, Motion Passed.

V. Consent Agenda

If passed by unanimous consent of the Board of Directors, all items listed will be approved simultaneously. Items can be pulled for separate discussion at the request of a Board member without a motion or a second.

President Gambarin pulled Item D from the consent agenda.

A. Approval of the Minutes

[09.24.2025 A.S. Board of Directors Meeting Minutes.pdf]

B. Action Item: Appoint Kayleigh Soriano as a Student-at-Large for Campus Life Affairs Committee (Presenters: Teairra Brown)

Kayleigh is a first-generation student with a strong passion for building community and sharing experiences on campus. They bring a lot of interest, energy, and ideas for outreach and events, making them a great fit for the Campus Life Affairs Committee. Their drive to connect students and create inclusive spaces aligns perfectly with the committee's mission.

[Student At Large Application - Kayleigh Soriano.pdf]

C. Action Item: Appoint Sophie Tran as a Student-at-Large for Campus Life Affairs Committee (Presenters: Teairra Brown)

Sophie is a first-year student who was involved in leadership during high school. She's eager to contribute to making the campus better by helping students access and share resources. Her background and enthusiasm show she's ready to step into the Campus Life Affairs Committee and support its mission.

[Student At Large Application - Sophie Tran.pdf]

D. Action Item: Appoint Valeria Rivera Arias as a Student-at-Large for Lobby Corps Committee (Presenters: Ma'Kayla Akin)

This student is a second-year Political Science major committed to advocacy and student involvement. They bring an open and optimistic leadership style, with strengths as both a motivator and organizer. Focused on key student issues such as parking and housing, they view advocacy as amplifying voices and improving communities. Their interest in developing public speaking skills and future goals in government make them a strong candidate for appointment as Student-at-Large.

**Motion:**

(3:21 PM) Chair Agustin recommends a motion to open the action item.

Motion moved by Director De Oliveira and motion seconded by Director Subramanyan.

Director Akin gave props to Valeria for the passion she showed in her interview. President Gambarin explained that she pulled the item because there was no application attached.

**Motion:**

Vote: 8-0-1, Motion Passed.

E. Action Item: Appoint Cami Hutson as a Student-at-Large for Internal Affairs Committee (Presenters: Laura Charles)

Second year Sociology Major, Legal Studies minor. Aspires to go to Law School for Juvenile Justice, and sees being a part of this committee as a guiding step towards that. Wants to serve and help the community and help in any way possible through being a Student at Large for the Internal Affairs Committee.

Student At Large Application - Cami Hutson.pdf

F. Action Item: Appoint Aditi Prabhu as the College of Health and Human Sciences Rep for the Academic Affairs Committee

Aditi Prabhu is a great fit for the Academic Affairs Committee because she has strong leadership experience from her work as a doctor, health educator, and student leader. As Co-President of the MPH Student Association, she has shown she can listen to students, identify their concerns, and work toward practical solutions. She is especially committed to making sure all students, including international students, feel supported and represented.

Student At Large Application - Aditi Prabhu-2.pdf

G. Action Item: Approve Vincent Wilson as the College of Social Sciences Rep for the Academic Affairs Committee

Vincent is passionate about making academics more flexible and accessible, with ideas such as hybrid class options and mid-semester student feedback to improve learning experience.
He brings strong leadership skills from organizing school events, sports, and student organizations, showing reliability and a detail-oriented approach. His commitment to inclusion and ensuring all student voices are heard makes him a strong advocate for academic improvements.

Student At Large Application - Vincent Wilson.pdf

H. Action Item: Approve Dheerajkrishna Giri as the College of Engineering Rep for the Academic Affairs Committee

Dheeraj is motivated to support all students academically, particularly those facing challenges with motivation, transition, or lack of resources. His experiences as a teacher's aide, retail worker, and active participant in engineering and data science clubs highlight his organizational skills, teamwork, and dedication to student success. He brings forward ideas for expanding peer tutoring and promoting academic reforms, blending practical leadership with a drive to improve both academic outcomes and student well-being.

Student At Large Application - Dheerajkrishna Giri.pdf

I. Action Item: Approve Nicole Johnston as the College of Business Rep for the Academic Affairs Committee

Nicole shows deep commitment to the College of Business and wants to ensure curriculum decisions reflect current student needs.With experience as a peer notetaker for the Accessible Education Center and leadership roles in her sorority and honors program, she demonstrates consistency, critical thinking, and a strong sense of responsibility. Her focus on equitable access to resources and student empowerment would make her a thoughtful and effective representative.

Student At Large Application - Nicole Johnston.pdf

J. Action Item: Vote to Appoint Ishan Shah to the Campus Fee Advisory Committee (Presenters: Katelyn Gambarin)

Academic Senate & University Committee Application Form 2025-2026 - I. Shah_Redacted.pdf

VI. Public Forum

Public Forum is intended as an opportunity for any member of the public to address the Associated Students Board of Directors regarding any issues affecting SJSU students. Speakers are allowed 3 minutes each to speak. Please sign in on the clip board if in person or if you are online sign in using chat for minute recording purposes.

Point of personal privilege was granted to Director Akin at 3:06 PM.
Guest Diana Garcia Rodriguez introduced Ange Grate, who introduced the Legacy Month speaker event happening tomorrow in the Student Union Theater. She read a bio of the guest speaker, Franchesca Ramsey. Ange also talked about the Rooted Festival event she has been planning, which will be held on October 23rd. Guest Ma'Kayla Akin discussed three incidents that have recently occurred on campus, involving the N-word written on residents' doors in multiple dorms. She encouraged the board to look into this matter.
Director Akin was re-recognized at 3:11 PM.

VII. Executive Director's Informational Report (4 minutes) (Presenters: Kingson Leung)

ED Report 10.08.2025.pdf

Interim Executive Director Kingson Leung echoed the promotion of Legacy Month events taking place this month. He also provided updates on the continued work for Homecoming Week and mentioned recent staff changes. Additionally, he gave shoutouts to several student leaders and student assistants, including Sam Brown and Director Mallari.

VIII. University Administration's Informational Report (3 minutes)

University Representative Heather French gave a gentle reminder that it is survey season and shared the deadlines for both launched and upcoming surveys. She also provided updates on the Time, Place, and Manner Policy and passed around the information card that has been distributed to centers on campus. Additionally, she introduced Sarah, the new Confidential Administrative Assistant in the Dean's Office.

IX. Student Union's Informational Report (3 minutes)

Student Union Executive Director Jon Tucker talked about an upcoming program that will feature free food and new decorations in the Student Union. He and President

Gambarin have been discussing potential changes to the Student Union. The aesthetics work in the Event Center is currently underway, and the Esports construction project will be kicking off soon. He expressed his excitement about these new improvements. He also mentioned the recent flood that occurred downstairs in the building due to a pipe burst, and noted that construction in the meeting rooms will begin soon as well.

X. Action Items

A. Unfinished Business

B. New Business

1. Action Item: Appoint an A.S. Representative to the Assigned Time for Exceptional Levels of Service to Students Committee (Presenters: Katelyn Gambarin)

The Assigned Time for Exceptional Levels of Service to Students Committee awards shall support service to students that goes beyond the normal expectations of all faculty such as:

- Student mentoring, advising, and outreach, especially as these activities support under-served, first-generation, and/or underrepresented students and other practices in support of such students, including those caused by cultural taxation
- The development and implementation of high-impact educational practices; curricular redesign intended to improve student access and success
- Service to the department, college, university, or community that goes significantly beyond the normal expectations of all faculty, and that directly or indirectly is of benefit to students
- Assignment to courses where increases to enrollment have demonstrably increased workload
- Other extraordinary forms of service to students

Committee meetings are planned for the period **Nov 21–Dec 17, 2025**. After the committee members are finalized, the Committee Manager will establish the specific meeting dates.

**Motion:**

Chair Agustin recommends a motion to open the action item.

Motion moved by Director De Oliveira and motion seconded by President Gambarin.

President Gambarin explained the role of the Assigned Time for Exceptional Levels of Service to Students Committee and mentioned that she is looking for an A.S. representative to serve on the committee. Director Akin asked who is currently on the committee and who is facilitating it. President Gambarin stated that she does not have many details at this time. Director Charles asked if there were any proposed meeting dates or times. President Gambarin responded that this was all the information she had received so far.

Chair Agustin clarified the purpose of the committee and explained how meetings are typically scheduled. Director De Oliveira recommended tabling the item due to the lack of detailed information about meeting times and dates. President Gambarin added that she had reached out to a committee member, who mentioned that the committee had met two to three times in the past. Director Subramanyan asked if there was a time constraint for the appointment and agreed that tabling the item would be appropriate.

Director De Oliveira yielded time to Guest Abby, who noted that the committee would work with members to decide on a meeting date and time. President Gambarin reiterated that this was all the information she had and encouraged anyone with questions to reach out to her so she could forward them to the committee. Director De Oliveira clarified that students were interested in participating but were uncertain about the meeting schedule. Director De Oliveira self-nominated for the position, and Director Akin seconded. Director Charles also expressed interest in serving.

**Motion:**

Amendment to appoint Director De Oliveira to the committee.

Motion moved by Director De Oliveira and motion seconded by Director Akin. Vote: 9-0-0, Motion Passed.

**Motion:**

Vote: 9-0-0, Motion Passed.

2. Discussion Item: 1st Read of Elections Regulation Manual (Presenters: Janely Pulido, Glerys Gonzalez)

   [ERM 24-25 - Edits.pdf]

   Guest Janely Pulido went over the edits that the Internal Committee and she had reviewed for the Election Regulation Manual. These edits included changes to the required ethics sessions and wording updates. President Gambarin asked if these changes were visible to the board. Janely replied that the changes should be visible on page 6.

3. Action Item: Approve $390.43 for Spartans United: Week of Action at SJSU (Presenters: Jhony De Oliveira)

   I would like to request the approval of the Board of Directors for the proposed budget to be used in purchasing giveaway prizes for the upcoming event. All details are outlined in the attached budget proposal document.

   _de Oliveira Spartans United _ Week of Action at SJSU Event Proposal - Google Docs.pdf

   **Motion:**
   Chair Agustin recommends a motion to open the action item.

   Motion moved by Director Subramanyan and motion seconded by Director Tuidelaibatiki.

   Director De Oliveira explained the proposed budget he is requesting.

   **Motion:**
   Vote: 9-0-0, Motion Passed.

4. Informational Item: Associated Students Transportation Solutions Department Presentation (Time Certain: 3:25pm, Max: 5 minutes) (Presenters: Kingson Leung, Guests: Haleema Bharoocha-Jobe, Shannon O'Halloran)

   Interim Executive Director Leung and the A.S. Leadership Team are committed to ensuring that the Board of Directors has comprehensive knowledge of the A.S. Departments. To facilitate this, during each meeting this fall semester, one or two AS Departments will present a informational item, providing deeper insights into their areas of focus. Each presentation will be a maximum of 5 minutes.

   AS Board Presentation 2025.pdf

   Guest Haleema and a student assistant from Transportation Solutions gave a presentation on Transportation Solutions. They discussed services and resources such as the Smart Pass, transit hubs near campus, discounts, and Lyft Bay Wheels.

5. Informational Item: Associated Students Print Shop Department Presentation (Time Certain: 3:30pm, Max: 5 minutes) (Presenters: Kingson Leung, Guests: Kevin Lowe)

   Interim Executive Director Leung and the A.S. Leadership Team are committed to ensuring that the Board of Directors has comprehensive knowledge of the A.S. Departments. To facilitate this, during each meeting this fall semester, one or two AS

Departments will present a informational item, providing deeper insights into their areas of focus. Each presentation will be a maximum of 5 minutes.

[Print Shop BoD Presentation 2025.pdf]

Kevin Lowe from the Print Shop gave a presentation about the department, including an overview of its programs and services, operations, impact, and future goals.

6. Discussion Item: First Read of Resolution Authorizing Continued Funding Application (Time Certain: 3:35pm) (Presenters: Jane Zamora)

   The Resolution Authorizing Continued Funding Application, if approved, allows the designated A.S. staff listed in the attached document to continue signing all contract related documents related to the the A.S. Child Development Centers' California State Preschool Program contract and Prekindergarten and Family Literacy Support contract for the 26/27 year.

   [Board resolution 26.27.pdf]

   Guest Jane Zamora explained the purpose of the resolution authorizing the continued funding application. Director Subramanyan proposed having a system to make annual items like this more efficient, suggesting that the Chair or CFO be able to sign off on such applications.

7. Discussion Item: Updates on Developing CSU Systemwide Initiatives (Time Certain at 3:45pm, Max: 15 mins) (Presenters: Katelyn Gambarin, Guests: Tara Al-Rehani)

   Cal State Student Association President Tara Al-Rehani provides an update on developing CSU Systemwide initiatives.

   Guest Tara Al-Rehani gave an update on developing CSU Systemwide Initiatives. This included goals, the strategic plan, and the student success framework, with updates on cost, advising, teaching and learning, streamlined experiences, and skills and networking. She explained what each section represents.
   President Gambarin yielded time to VPSA Mari Fuentes-Martin, who thanked Tara for the update and encouraged hosting a workshop to educate others about these initiatives.

8. Action Item: Approve $3000 for SKY Club SJSU (Time Certain: 4:00pm, Max: 15 mins) (Presenters: Rishika Joshi, Representatives From RSO)

   [Letter from Club Advisor.pdf]

[San Jose State University SJSU_Fall 2025_quote # 328.pdf]
[SKY Art Supplies.pdf]
[SKY Food and Snacks.pdf]
[SKY Funding Request Form 2025.pdf]
[SKY Logo Apparel (1).pdf]
[SKY Promotional Item.pdf]
[8.pdf]

Item was stricken.

9. Action Item: Approve $3000 for SOLES SJSU (Time Certain: 4:15pm, Max: 15 mins) (Presenters: Rishika Joshi, Representatives From RSO)

[Cost of flight.pdf]
[Funding_Request_Form_SOLES_.pdf]
[SOLES.pdf]
[A.S. Funding Meeting Presentation_SOLES.pptx]

**Motion:**
Chair Agustin recommends a motion to open the action item.

Motion moved by Director Subramanyan and motion seconded by Director Tuidelaibatiki.

On behalf of Controller Joshi, Director Subramanyan explained that this RSO was unable to present at the last Finance Committee Meeting due to time constraints. Representatives from SOLES SJSU gave a presentation, starting with their goals and then discussing their SHPE National Convention. They talked about the ticket prices for the convention and mentioned that they would also be representing A.S. at the event.
On behalf of Controller Joshi, Director Subramanyan noted that the RSO had included all the required information in their request. Director Tuidelaibatiki asked how members who can attend the convention will be selected. The guests explained that selection is based on multiple factors, including experience and active involvement.
Director Rosal asked about the gender ratio within the organization, and the guests responded that it is approximately 70% male and 30% female.
Director Subramanyan asked why the group was requesting $3,000 when

they already have $3,000 in their account. The guests explained that the existing funds will cover food, lodging, and additional flight expenses. Director Subramanyan expressed concern that allocating the majority of the funding toward conferences, which are limited to certain members, may not be fair to all members of the club. The guests explained that attendance rotates among members to ensure fairness.
Director Akin commended the presenters and clarified that this request would bring them to the maximum amount allowed for funding. Director Charles asked about the selection process, and the guests reiterated their previous explanation. Chair Agustin clarified that the organization will need to be present at the Spartan Showcase at the end of the year.

**Motion:**
Vote: 8-0-1, Motion Passed.

10. Action Item: Approve $1350 for AkbayanSJSU (Time Certain: 4:30pm, Max: 15 mins) (Presenters: Rishika Joshi, Representatives From RSO)

- A.S. Funding Request (Ma"BOO"Hay) (1).pdf
- Kimmy Bio (1).pdf
- Kimmy Pidazo Finances - Expense Breakdown (1).pdf
- Steven Kou (Quote from August 27th, 2025) (1).pdf
- Steven Kou EPK 2025 (1).pdf
- Ma'BOO'Hay A.S. Funding Presentation.pptx

**Motion:**
Chair Agustin recommends a motion to open the action item.

Motion moved by Director Subramanyan and motion seconded by Director Tuidelaibatiki.

Chair Agustin and Director Mallari disclosed that they are members of Akbayan. Interim Executive Director Kingson Leung clarified that recusal was not required.
On behalf of Controller Joshi, Director Subramanyan explained that this club was unable to present at the last Finance Committee meeting due to time constraints. Representatives from Akbayan introduced themselves, presented their slides, and explained the purpose of their event, *Ma'Boo'Hay.* They outlined how the requested $1,350 would be used and where the funds raised would be donated.

On behalf of Controller Joshi, Director Subramanyan reviewed the funding recommendation, explaining that because the organization did not participate in last year's Spartan Showcase, the maximum funding available for concerts ($1,500) was reduced to $750 as a penalty. She also asked about the $11,000 currently in their account. The representatives clarified that those funds are allocated for other events and programs throughout the academic year.
Director De Oliveira asked whether students would be charged for tickets. The representatives explained the ticket prices and mentioned an additional cost for a meet-and-greet with the performers. Director Mallari asked the board for clarification on the $750 funding cap, and Director Akin explained that it could be amended. When asked about their plan if funding were approved, the representatives stated that the $750 would be used to cover one artist, while the other would be paid for through their own budget.
Interim Executive Director Kingson Leung reminded the board that A.S. funding cannot be used to generate revenue. The representatives assured that all proceeds would be donated to a local center. Director Subramanyan asked whether the board could request a written statement confirming that the proceeds would go toward the center. Director Akin agreed and suggested adding a parameter requiring the organization to provide a receipt of the donation. Director De Oliveira asked if there was anything the organization could do for students who cannot afford a ticket. Director Subramanyan inquired about ticket details, and the representatives responded that they plan to sell 200 tickets and have not sold any yet.

Chair Agustin recommended a motion to extend the discussion on the item by 5 minutes.
Motioned by: Director Subramanyan / Seconded by: Director Charles
Vote: 9-0-0

Director Tuidelaibatiki reminded the board that the event's purpose is cultural. Director Akin clarified that while she supports the event, she had concerns about the additional charge for the meet-and-greet when A.S. funding is being used. President Gambarin agreed, expressing support for approving $750 with proof of donation. Director De Oliveira disagreed and suggested that 20–25 tickets be set aside for students unable to pay.

The representatives responded that they could arrange payment plans and further explained the nature of the meet-and-greet.
Director Charles proposed a potential solution of holding a raffle where students could opt out of the additional fee for the meet-and-greet.
Director Subramanyan clarified that she had no objections to approving the funding but reiterated the importance of requiring proof of donation.

**Motion:**
Motion to amend the funding amount to $750 with proof of donation.

Motion moved by Director Akin and motion seconded by Director Subramanyan. Vote: 9-0-0, Motion Passed.

**Motion:**
Vote: 9-0-0, Motion Passed.

XI. Executive Officer Reports (4 minutes each)

A. President

President Gambarin talked about the current Academic Senate roles and provided an update on recent Academic Senate discussions. She mentioned that she is looking to have Parking Services attend a future board meeting to speak with the board. She also discussed campus safety concerns related to e-scooters and added that she will be attending the October Plenary.

K.Gambarin Board Report - 10_08_2025.docx.pdf

B. Vice President

Vice President Agustin talked about the progress of his goals and initiatives. He also gave an update on the committees he is a part of.

G.Agustin Board Report - 10.8.2025.pdf

C. Controller

N/A

R.Joshi Board Report - 10.8.2025.pdf

XII. Directors' Reports (3 minutes each)

A. Director of Academic Affairs

Director Paredes gave an update on what the Academic Affairs Committee went over and what they are focusing on.

E. Paredes Board Report 10.01.2025.pdf

B. Director of Business Affairs

Director Subramanyan gave an update on how her committee meetings went.

S.Subramanyan Board Report - 09.24.2025.docx (1).pdf

C. Director of Co-Curricular Affairs

N/A

S.Jha Board Report - 10.08.25.docx.pdf

D. Director of Communications

Director Rosal talked about her new focus on sparking student interest in leadership roles. She gave updates on the committees she is involved in and the projects she has been working on. She also mentioned updating the website with everyone's current information and explained her Board Engagement Initiative.

Bella Rosal - Board Report 10_08.docx.pdf

E. Director of Intercultural Affairs

Director Tuidelaibatiki talked about her Multicultural Advisory Committee, noting that it now has a full membership and that the meeting went well.

A.Tuidelaibatiki Board Report 10.08.2025.pdf

F. Director of Internal Affairs (Presenters: Laura Charles)

Director Charles gave an update on what has been happening in the committees she is a part of. She talked about a focus group she attended on behalf of CAPS and discussed a program that could benefit students.

L.Charles Internal Affairs Board Report 10_8_2025.docx.pdf

G. Director of Legislative Affairs (Presenters: Ma'Kayla Akin)

Director Akin talked about the conference she attended two weeks ago. She gave updates on the committee meetings she was a part of. She also mentioned that Vote Early Day will be happening on the 20th and talked about the workshops she is planning.

10_8_2025 Board Report .docx.pdf

H. Director of Student Resource Affairs

N/A

T. Brown Board Report 10-8-2025.docx.pdf

I. Director of Student Rights and Responsibilities

Director De Oliveira went over the progress of his goals and initiatives. He talked about the event he has been planning and working on and gave an update that over $9,000 has been funded. He also discussed the liaison meetings he has attended and shared what he learned from the UPD event.

de Oliveira Board Report 10_08_25.docx.pdf

J. Director of Sustainability Affairs

Director Mallari talked about her goals and initiatives, including the Bay Pass and an event she is planning. She also went over her committee meetings and other meetings she attended.

Additionally, she talked about the Legacy Month events happening this month and the keynote speaker who will be on campus tomorrow.

K.Mallari Board Report 10.8.2025.docx.pdf

## XIII. Announcements

Director De Oliveira shared that Director Brown's scavenger hunt is happening this week. He also mentioned that Director Brown has continued working on her projects despite being sick and noted that no board members were willing to assist when she asked for help. President Gambarin reminded everyone to take care of themselves and look out for one another as it is flu season.
Interim Executive Director Kingson Leung mentioned that the In-Service is next week and that members of the President's Cabinet will be attending.
Director De Oliveira asked for clarification on what types of items can be shared during announcements. Leung explained that announcements should focus on opportunities for members to participate in.
Director Akin also mentioned an upcoming event.

## XIV. Adjournment

**Motion:**

Chair Agustin recommends a motion to adjourn the meeting at 5:18 pm.

Motion moved by Director Subramanyan and motion seconded by Director De Oliveira.
Vote: 9-0-0, Motion Passed.

Geoffrey Agustin
2025-10-09 21:34 UTC

***2025-2026***
***Associated Students***
***Board of Directors***

**Date: 10.8.2025**
ROLL CALL

| NAME | Attendance |
|---|---|
| President Gambarin | X |
| Vice President Agustin | X |
| Controller Joshi | A |
| Director Paredes | X |
| Director Subramanyan | X |
| Director Rosal | X |
| Director Jha | A |
| Director Tuidelaibatiki | X |
| Director Charles | X |
| Director Akin | X |
| Director Brown | A |
| Director De Oliveira | X |
| Director Mallari | X |
| | |
| **Non-voting Members** | |
| Interim Executive Director Kingson Leung | X |
| University Representative Dr. Heather French | X |
| | |
| Sam Brown - Recording Secretary | X |

***Legends:***
**X –** Present
**A –** Absent

**Guests:** Abby Escobar, Janely Pulido, Diana Victa, Andrea Manucat, Devin Elizarde, Jaxson Tancioco, Jane Zamora, Sarah Do, Jon Tucker, Tara Al-Rehani, Javier Gomez, Bryan De La Rosa-Bustamante, Kevin Lowe, Cynthia Aguinaga, Haleema Bharoocha-Jobe, Diana Garcia Rodriguez, Ana, Artur Gafurov, Beverly Corriere, Teairra Brown (present on Zoom but unable to participate as a voting member), Rishika Joshi (present on Zoom but unable to participate as a voting member)